Provided for non-commercial research and education use. Not for reproduction, distribution or commercial use.



This article appeared in a journal published by Elsevier. The attached copy is furnished to the author for internal non-commercial research and education use, including for instruction at the authors institution and sharing with colleagues.

Other uses, including reproduction and distribution, or selling or licensing copies, or posting to personal, institutional or third party websites are prohibited.

In most cases authors are permitted to post their version of the article (e.g. in Word or Tex form) to their personal website or institutional repository. Authors requiring further information regarding Elsevier's archiving and manuscript policies are encouraged to visit:

http://www.elsevier.com/copyright

PUBLIC HEALTH 126 (2012) 904



Available online at www.sciencedirect.com

Public Health

journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/puhe



Letter to the Editor

The framework convention on tobacco control's original sin

Lien and DeLand suggested to use the Framework Convention on Tobacco Control (FCTC) as a model for other non-communicable disease control.¹

This international treaty designed to respond to the tobacco pandemic has an original sin which precludes effectiveness: the lack of a monitoring body for reporting violations. These are enduring and obvious.

France was the first of the old Members of the European Union to ratify the FCTC treaty in October 2004. However, cigarette sales remain steady from 54.9×10^3 metric tons in 2004 to 55.0×10^3 in 2010 while cross-border purchase increased as rolling tobacco sales. This result is not surprising as the measures implemented for tobacco control appear flawed. A national study in March 2011 showed an increase in prevalence of daily smoking in those 17 y old from 28.9% in 2008 to 31.5% in 2011. This suggests that the government sacrifices its citizens' health to vested interests, for tobacco control as for alcohol control.

Netherlands has weakened existing smoke-free-laws, reversed the support for smoking cessation, and plan to close down the national center on tobacco control (STIVORO).

These governments must be blamed for breaching the article 5.3 of the FCTC which specifically requires protecting public policy from tobacco industry influences.

Neither naivety nor hope can yield compliance and results. *Errare humanum est, sed perseverare diabolicum* (to err is human, but to persist in the mistake is diabolical).

Conflict of interest

Pr Dubois was sued for libel by the Confédération des Buralistes (the Frenchtobacconists' union) in Sept 2009. Dr Braillon, a senior tenured consultant in Pr Dubois' unit was sacked in Sept 2010 by the National Management Centre (Department of Health) against the advice of the National Statutory. (Abuse of libel laws and a sacking: The gagging of public health experts in France. Tobacco control blog 8 November 2010).

Funding

None.

Ethical approval

None declared.

REFERENCES

- Lien G, Deland K. Translating the WHO framework convention on tobacco control (FCTC): can we use tobacco control as a model for other non-communicable disease control? *Public Health* 2011;125:847-53.
- Braillon A, Dubois G. Framework convention on tobacco control ... in search of outcomes. The responsibility to protect. Health Policy 2011;103:98–9.
- 3. Braillon A, Dubois G. Searching for an indicator of the influence of the tobacco lobby on politicians. Am J Prev Med 2011;41:e29.
- Dautzenberg B. Catastrophique reprise du tabagisme chez les collégiens parisiens. Available at:[accessed 12.12.11], www. ofta-asso.fr/index.php/./94-resultats-enquete-pst-2010-4pages; 6 May 2010.
- Braillon A, Dubois G. Alcohol control policy: evidence-based medicine versus evidence-based marketing. Addiction 2011; 106:852–3.
- Arnott D, Berteletti F, Britton J, Cardone A, Clancy L, Craig L, et al. Can the Dutch government really be abandoning smokers to their fate? Online Dec 8. Lancet; 2011;. <u>doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(11)61855-2</u>.

A. Braillon* Gres, Public Health, 27 rue Voiture, 80000 Amiens, France

G. Dubois

Public Health, Amiens University Hospital, France

*Corresponding author. Tel.: +33 6 87 99 58 12. E-mail address: braillon.alain@gmail.com (A. Braillon)

Available online 6 July 2012

0033-3506/\$ — see front matter © 2012 The Royal Society for Public Health. Published by Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved. doi:10.1016/j.puhe.2012.02.016